1

Kathleen Fennell@ilnd.uscourts.gov

25

	1	(Proceedings heard in open court:)
	2	THE COURT: Good morning, everybody.
	3	MR. CHANDRA: Good morning.
	4	THE COURT: Maybe you could introduce yourselves.
10:01:59	5	MS. MALIZIA: Good morning, your Honor. Kathryn
	6	Malizia on behalf of the United States.
	7	MR. CHANDRA: Good morning, your Honor. Piyush
	8	Chandra with the Federal Defender Program, and Mr. El Bey is
	9	present as well.
10:02:10	10	THE COURT: This you are Mr. El Bey?
	11	THE DEFENDANT: Yeah, I am, yes, sir.
	12	THE COURT: All righty. Well, we can get started.
	13	You can all sit back.
	14	Well, is there anything so this is a hearing about
10:02:24	15	representation of Mr. El Bey. So is there anything, any
	16	preliminaries before I ask him the necessary questions or
	17	MR. CHANDRA: No, your Honor. I filed my motion to
	18	withdraw based on Mr. El Bey's request to represent himself.
	19	I've had an opportunity to speak with Mr. El Bey on
10:02:49	20	two occasions regarding regarding that issue and proceeding
	21	in that manner, and he, after having those discussions, he
	22	reiterated that he wished to represent himself.
	23	THE COURT: And does the prosecutor have anything?
	24	MS. MALIZIA: Your Honor, the government has no
10:03:07	25	objection to Mr. Chandra withdrawing as counsel provided that

1 is what Mr. El Bey has expressed. 2 THE COURT: Provided what? 3 MS. MALIZIA: Provided that is Mr. El Bey's expressed 4 wish that he represent himself in this case. 5 THE COURT: Okay. Well, why don't I -- Mr. El Bey, 10:03:19 6 why don't you take the -- you know, stand in front of the mic 7 there, and I will -- I will ask you a few questions. 8 So, what did I do with my -- so under the law, you 9 have a right to counsel. You also have a right, with some 10 qualifications, to represent yourself. And so far as counsel 10:04:08 11 is concerned, depending on your financial circumstances, you 12 may be entitled to have a lawyer appointed by the court and 13 you wouldn't have to pay anything. That's one possibility. 14 If -- but if you have, you know, significant 15 financial resources, then I wouldn't be allowed to appoint 10:04:36 16 someone. You would have to hire a lawyer. I could help you 17 find a lawyer, but you would have to pay for the lawyer. 18 So that's -- that's the choice. If you have no 19 resources, you can have an appointed counsel, like the Federal 20 Defender, and, you know, if you and this particular Federal 10:04:57 21 Defender don't get along, there are other lawyers who could be

Defender don't get along, there are other lawyers who could appointed. But if you do have financial resources, then I just do not have the authority to appoint a lawyer, and you would have -- I mean -- and you would have to pay for a lawyer, although we could help you find one.

	1	So that's that's your choice. And if you do want
	2	to represent yourself, then I do have to ask you a few
	3	questions. I'm also required to caution you about the
	4	downside of self-representation.
10:05:43	5	So, let me ask you whether you would prefer to
	6	represent yourself than to have an attorney?
	7	THE DEFENDANT: I didn't understand, your Honor.
	8	THE COURT: Let me ask whether you would prefer to
	9	represent yourself rather than to have a lawyer?
10:06:04	10	THE DEFENDANT: Yes. I'm coming in, your Honor, as a
	11	friend of the court in my own accord motu proprio.
	12	THE COURT: I'm sorry, could you say that? I
	13	didn't
	14	THE DEFENDANT: I'm coming in as a friend of the
10:06:21	15	court on my own accord motu proprio.
	16	THE COURT: I didn't understand the last couple of
	17	words. Is that English?
	18	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, it is, motu proprio. Motu
	19	proprio, your Honor.
10:06:35	20	THE COURT: Oh, I just don't understand those words.
	21	THE DEFENDANT: Okay. Well, I'm coming in in the
	22	flesh on my own accord.
	23	THE COURT: Okay. So you want to represent yourself.
	24	THE DEFENDANT: I want to represent myself not
10:06:46	25	represent myself.

THE COURT: Oh, on your own accord, okay, that's what I understand. Okay. And are you familiar with the the offenses with which you're charged?  THE DEFENDANT: Yes.  THE COURT: The fraud, and you realize that if you are convicted, if you lose your case, there is a potentially heavy penalty, you know, long prison sentence is a possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do.  THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with the the offense with the offense with the the offense with the offense with the the offense with the		1	THE COURT: I'm sorry.
THE COURT: Oh, on your own accord, okay, that's what I understand. Okay. And are you familiar with the the offenses with which you're charged?  THE DEFENDANT: Yes.  THE COURT: The fraud, and you realize that if you are convicted, if you lose your case, there is a potentially heavy penalty, you know, long prison sentence is a possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do.  THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		2	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I'm coming in on my own accord
what I understand. Okay. And are you familiar with the the offenses with which you're charged?  THE DEFENDANT: Yes.  THE COURT: The fraud, and you realize that if you are convicted, if you lose your case, there is a potentially heavy penalty, you know, long prison sentence is a possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do.  THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		3	in the flesh
the offenses with which you're charged?  THE DEFENDANT: Yes.  THE COURT: The fraud, and you realize that if you are convicted, if you lose your case, there is a potentially heavy penalty, you know, long prison sentence is a possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do.  THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		4	THE COURT: Oh, on your own accord, okay, that's
THE DEFENDANT: Yes.  THE COURT: The fraud, and you realize that if you are convicted, if you lose your case, there is a potentially heavy penalty, you know, long prison sentence is a possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do.  THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE COURT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with	10:06:59	5	what I understand. Okay. And are you familiar with the
THE COURT: The fraud, and you realize that if you are convicted, if you lose your case, there is a potentially heavy penalty, you know, long prison sentence is a possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do.  THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		6	the offenses with which you're charged?
are convicted, if you lose your case, there is a potentially heavy penalty, you know, long prison sentence is a possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do.  THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		7	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
heavy penalty, you know, long prison sentence is a possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do. THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me? THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have. THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		8	THE COURT: The fraud, and you realize that if you
possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do.  THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		9	are convicted, if you lose your case, there is a potentially
you realize, it's a serious case.  THE DEFENDANT: I do.  THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a  defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll  be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know,  maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied  law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before,  yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with	10:07:24	10	heavy penalty, you know, long prison sentence is a
THE DEFENDANT: I do.  14 THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a  15 defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll  16 be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know,  17 maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied  18 law?  19 THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before,  20 yes, sir.  21 THE COURT: Excuse me?  22 THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  23 I filed federal cases before. I have.  24 THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		11	possibility. It's not a certainty, but there is I'm sure
THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me? THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases. I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		12	you realize, it's a serious case.
defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		13	THE DEFENDANT: I do.
be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know, maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		14	THE COURT: So so we're required to advise a
maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied law?  THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with	10:07:51	15	defendant who wants to represent himself that it's you'll
18 law? 19 THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, 20 yes, sir. 21 THE COURT: Excuse me? 22 THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases. 23 I filed federal cases before. I have. 24 THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		16	be at a disadvantage if you do not have I don't know,
THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before, yes, sir.  THE COURT: Excuse me? THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases. I filed federal cases before. I have. THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		17	maybe do you have any legal training, or have you studied
yes, sir.  21 THE COURT: Excuse me?  22 THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  23 I filed federal cases before. I have.  24 THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		18	law?
THE COURT: Excuse me?  THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with		19	THE DEFENDANT: I've been in federal cases before,
THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.  I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with	10:08:13	20	yes, sir.
I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity wit		21	THE COURT: Excuse me?
24 THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity wit		22	THE DEFENDANT: I've held been in federal cases.
		23	I filed federal cases before. I have.
THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.		24	THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with.
,	10:08:20	25	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	10:08:20	23 24	I filed federal cases before. I have.  THE COURT: Okay. So you have some familiarity with.

	1	THE COURT: But you haven't studied I mean, you
	2	didn't go to law school or anything.
	3	THE DEFENDANT: No.
	4	THE COURT: Have have you ever previously
10:08:30	5	represented yourself in a case?
	6	THE DEFENDANT: I have.
	7	THE COURT: You have.
	8	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.
	9	THE COURT: Was that a criminal or a civil case?
10:08:37	10	THE DEFENDANT: No, it was a case that I brought
	11	myself.
	12	THE COURT: That you brought yourself.
	13	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.
	14	THE COURT: And how did you do in your case?
10:08:44	15	THE DEFENDANT: I don't remember.
	16	THE COURT: Now, most of what a trial, a criminal
	17	trial, consists of is, you know, testimony by witnesses. And
	18	when a witness testifies, often the opposing lawyer will make
	19	an objection, say like hearsay or leading or not best
10:09:30	20	evidence.
	21	Now, if the prosecutor were to make an objection, say
	22	you were testifying or you had a witness who was testifying
	23	for you. If the prosecutor said objection, hearsay, or
	24	objection, leading, or objection, asked and answered, will you
10:09:53	25	be will you be comfortable in evaluating the validity of

1 the objection? Because often, if you have lawyers on both 2 sides and one lawyer says objection, the other lawyer will --3 may say, well, Judge, you know, I'd like to approach the 4 I'd like to -- I'd like to explain why I don't think 5 that's a valid objection. 10:10:18 6 Now, if you're -- assuming, although you say you've 7 had some experience in court, but if you're not actually 8 familiar with the Federal Rules of Evidence, it will be 9 difficult for you to contest an objection. So that's 10 something you have to think about. 10:10:39 11 And I have to tell you also that I don't know whether 12 you've had any previous experience with federal criminal 13 prosecutions, but the -- you're up against the United States, 14 right, the Justice Department, and just in this district, 15 which is mainly Chicago, what, you have more than a hundred 10:11:08 16 lawyers, don't you? 17 MS. MALIZIA: That's correct, your Honor. 18 THE COURT: These -- to be an Assistant United States 19 Attorney, which means to be a federal prosecutor, this is a 20 very elite job. This is very coveted by young lawyers, and 10:11:25 21 they just get terrific people. So these are real pros and 22 they're top law school graduates, and, you know, for anybody 23 who is not a lawyer to have to be dueling with one of these 24 prosecutors, it's very difficult. I mean, it's difficult for 25 the experienced lawyers to go up against them.

10:11:57

1 So, you know, you want to think carefully whether you 2 feel you can -- you can, without, I say, formal legal 3 training, without -- whether you really are able to go up, you 4 know, on terms of approximate equality with the ... 5 In addition, if you ever looked at the, and certainly 10:12:34 6 can furnish you with the Federal Rules of Evidence, they're 7 really formidable, and they go on and on. 8 And so there's this -- there's a general rule against hearsay, which means, you know, if someone told you something 9 10 and you want to say that that person was telling the truth, 10:12:59 11 and that sort of secondhand evidence is generally excluded, 12 but there are, I don't know, you know better than I do, but I 13 think there are more than 20 exceptions to the hearsay rule. 14 So if you were to object, say, it's hearsay, that the 15 prosecutor wanted to put in hearsay evidence, she would say, 10:13:20 16 well, yes, but there's Exception No. 13 or No. 17 or 17 something, and you would be at a disadvantage because you're 18 not, you know, steeped in all this stuff. I find it very 19 confusing. I've been a lawyer for 53 years. 20 So generally with very, very rare exceptions, we 10:13:42 21 advise -- we advise defendants that a competent lawyer who's 22 experienced in criminal cases will do a much more effective 23 job of defending you than you can do yourself, no matter how 24 intelligent and articulate you are, because you lack the

25

10:14:24

training.

1 So there's another thing which is unrelated to 2 training, and so suppose that you decide that you want to 3 Now, you don't have to. There's no -- we can't 4 compel a criminal defendant to testify, but if you decide to 5 testify, you're in a somewhat awkward position because for 10:14:41 6 ordinary testimony, the lawyer asks questions, the witness 7 answers. It's very difficult for you. I don't know how a 8 9 jury, find it very puzzling if you tried to ask yourself 10 questions. So you'd be providing a narrative, unlike the 10:15:01 11 other witnesses, and the jury, you know, might wonder what --12 what this was about and whether this was, you know, kosher, 13 whatever. And, you know, I could explain to the jury, you 14 know, the defendant is representing himself. That's his 15 right. And, of course, he can't really question himself, so 10:15:27 16 he'll be narrating his testimony, but, you know, you should 17 consider it as seriously as you'd consider any other witness's 18 testimony, but it's -- it will be a problem. 19 And, again, it will be a situation where if the 20 10:15:43 21 22

23

24

25

10:16:10

prosecutor says I object, you may find it, I mean, both awkward because you're in the witness box testifying, but also awkward because you're -- you're not going to be, as I say, steeped in the rules of evidence. And we may have to recess to give you a chance to study the particular rule of evidence in question and that may, you know, annoy the jury as delay,

it's delaying the trial.

Another complication, there's typically an opening statement by the lawyers and then a closing statement to the jury, and these statements have to remain within particular boundaries having to do with the nature of the case, and the jury is -- the judge is going to instruct the jury.

That's another difficult problem for a nonlawyer defending himself because toward the end of the trial, there will be an instructions conference, at which both sides propose instructions, you know, defining the crime and defining the state of mind that a defendant has to have to be convicted. And the prosecutor undoubtedly will come in with a set of instructions, and you will be at a disadvantage trying to challenge her instructions, suggesting your own instructions, putting them in language which is considered legally appropriate. So that's another problem.

So it's very, very uphill to defend yourself, but it, as I say, if you -- if you feel that you -- that that's advantageous for you, then you certainly have that right.

Now, you may want to think about this or discuss it with your friends or something like that.

One final wrinkle here, we usually, in a case where the defendant does decide to defend himself, we appoint a lawyer as what we call standby counsel. So the lawyer will not be representing you, but he'll -- he'll be available as a

10:16:37

10:17:02

10:17:27 15

10:18:12 20

10:18:47 25

	1	resource. If you have questions about the law, he can he
	2	may be able to answer you. Again, there's a certain
	3	awkwardness because if you have to ask the standby counsel
	4	questions, it kind of interrupts the trial, and, you know, the
10:19:13	5	jury the jury is going to come in with the expectation that
	6	both sides are represented by lawyers, and if they see the
	7	defendant is representing himself, they may say, oh, this is
	8	kind of weird stuff, what's going on, and it's just another
	9	way in which I will, of course, explain to the jury it's
10:19:39	10	perfectly permissible for a defendant to defend himself, but
	11	the jury, they're going to have their own views and they may
	12	feel this is this is irregular.
	13	So I would certainly recommend that you hire a lawyer
	14	if you can afford to or if you can't, I'll appoint one, but
10:20:07	15	that would be my advice to you. But if you're if you're
	16	really set on defending yourself, then that's your right.
	17	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I am.
	18	THE COURT: You may want to think about it. You
	19	don't have to decide today.
10:20:29	20	THE DEFENDANT: No, I'm I'm ready to defend
	21	myself.
	22	THE COURT: I'm sorry, you have to speak a little
	23	louder.
	24	THE DEFENDANT: No, nothing to think about. I'm
10:20:37	25	ready to defend myself.

	1	THE COURT: You're definite about that.
	2	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir.
	3	THE COURT: Do you have any
	4	MS. MALIZIA: Your Honor, would you object to me
10:20:43	5	advising the defendant one more time of the crimes with which
	6	he's charged?
	7	THE COURT: I'm sorry?
	8	MS. MALIZIA: Would you object to me advising the
	9	defendant one more time of the crimes with which he is charged
10:20:52	10	and the maximum penalties for those crimes?
	11	THE COURT: Okay, you may if you wish.
	12	MS. MALIZIA: The defendant is charged with two
	13	counts of mail fraud. Each of these counts carries a maximum
	14	penalty of 20 years, or a maximum fine of \$250,000 or twice
10:21:07	15	the gross gain or loss.
	16	So each of those counts alleges that the defendant
	17	defrauded the government of \$300,000. So twice \$300,000,
	18	that's 600,000 on each count. In addition, each of those
	19	counts, your sentence can run consecutively for a maximum
10:21:23	20	sentence of up to 40 years.
	21	You're also charged with six counts of making false
	22	claims against the government.
	23	Do you understand what that means?
	24	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, I do.
10:21:33	25	MS. MALIZIA: Each of those counts carries a maximum

	1	penalty of 20 years and a maximum fine of \$250,000.
	2	Do you understand that?
	3	THE DEFENDANT: I do.
	4	MS. MALIZIA: And those sentences can run
10:21:41	5	consecutively.
	6	THE DEFENDANT: Okay.
	7	MS. MALIZIA: Are you familiar with the sentencing
	8	the sentencing guidelines?
	9	THE DEFENDANT: I am. I'm pretty familiar I'm
10:21:50	10	pretty familiar. I don't need to be you don't have to I
	11	understand the charges that you're bringing against me, and as
	12	I said before, I'm ready to defend myself.
	13	MS. MALIZIA: Okay.
	14	THE DEFENDANT: Okay.
10:21:59	15	MS. MALIZIA: All right.
	16	THE COURT: Is there anything further that I should
	17	do at this hearing or
	18	MS. MALIZIA: I just wanted to be clear that the
	19	defendant is aware of the maximum penalties he's facing should
10:22:13	20	he choose to represent himself.
	21	THE COURT: So so, Mr. El Bey, I would suggest
	22	that I appoint standby counsel, but but if you don't want
	23	me to, I won't. It's up to you.
	24	THE DEFENDANT: No.
10:22:39	25	THE COURT: You don't want standby counsel.

	1	THE DEFENDANT: No, sir.
	2	THE COURT: Okay. So as I say, is there anything
	3	else we need to discuss or
	4	MS. MALIZIA: Oh, could we set a motion date, your
10:22:55	5	Honor?
	6	THE COURT: Pardon?
	7	MS. MALIZIA: A schedule for pretrial motions and a
	8	new status date?
	9	THE COURT: Right. Do you have a suggested date?
10:23:08	10	I had some dates, but I think they're probably too
	11	close.
	12	MS. MALIZIA: We could do 30 days out.
	13	THE COURT: Excuse me?
	14	MS. MALIZIA: 30 days.
10:23:18	15	THE COURT: 30 days from today
	16	MS. MALIZIA: Is that all right?
	17	THE COURT: is your suggestion?
	18	What do you think?
	19	THE DEFENDANT: Today is the yeah, that would be
10:23:27	20	fine.
	21	MS. MALIZIA: Will that give you enough time to file
	22	any pretrial motions?
	23	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, it will. 30 days will give me
	24	time to do what I need to do.
10:23:34	25	MR. CHANDRA: And, Judge, I can tender discovery

	1	today to
	2	THE COURT: Excuse me? I'm sorry, I can't hear you.
	3	MR. CHANDRA: I'm sorry. I can tender the discovery
	4	I received from the government to Mr. El Bey today.
10:23:44	5	THE COURT: Tender it to
	6	MR. CHANDRA: Mr. El Bey today.
	7	THE COURT: Okay. So is the 30 days, do the hearing
	8	on pretrial filings, is that okay?
	9	THE DEFENDANT: Well, can we make it around the end
10:23:59	10	of October? That way I have a little time to because I
	11	feel like I'm at a disadvantage because I haven't received
	12	anything, so I need time to look at her discoveries and get
	13	mine prepared and do the things I need to do.
	14	THE COURT: So you'd prefer it to be end of October
10:24:18	15	rather than middle of October.
	16	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
	17	MS. MALIZIA: There's no objection from the
	18	government.
	19	THE COURT: Excuse me?
10:24:23	20	MS. MALIZIA: No objection from the government, your
	21	Honor.
	22	THE COURT: Okay. I'll I'll pick a date at the
	23	end of October.
	24	And what about the next stage after that?
10:24:37	25	MS. MALIZIA: Well, depending on what Mr. El Bey

	1	files, I'm not sure if he's going to he may try to suppress
	2	evidence in this case. It's really hard to say. I haven't
	3	had any communication either with counsel or with Mr. El Bey
	4	at this time about his intentions moving forward.
10:24:54	5	THE COURT: Okay. So the 30-day well, it's no
	6	longer. So toward the end of October, there will be these
	7	pretrial filings.
	8	MS. MALIZIA: I think
	9	THE COURT: And then you're saying you want some
10:25:07	10	interval to decide whether to
	11	MS. MALIZIA: I think at that time, I would have some
	12	sense whether or not it would be appropriate to set a trial
	13	date or a change of plea.
	14	THE COURT: I see.
10:25:16	15	THE DEFENDANT: I don't have any information on
	16	anyone. I don't even know who's coming at me. I haven't
	17	received any information about
	18	THE COURT: She's coming at you.
	19	THE DEFENDANT: I just need all her information and
10:25:27	20	whoever is
	21	MS. MALIZIA: I will say the discovery in this case
	22	is not voluminous, but it is substantial.
	23	THE COURT: That's yours, the government's discovery.
	24	MS. MALIZIA: Yes. I tendered it to counsel last
10:25:38	25	week, but it sounds like Mr. El Bey has not had a chance to

	1	review any of it.
	2	THE DEFENDANT: Well, he said he couldn't open it.
	3	He said it had a code on it, that he couldn't open it, so it
	4	didn't do me any good.
10:25:50	5	MS. MALIZIA: The password is actually in the cover
	6	letter to the discovery, but if you have any trouble accessing
	7	it, please let me know.
	8	MR. CHANDRA: I'll and the government made that
	9	clear to me, and I'll make sure Mr. El Bey sees where that
10:26:03	10	password is.
	11	THE COURT: Would it make sense for the Federal
	12	Defender to remain, you know, until until next month to
	13	make sure you get everything?
	14	MR. CHANDRA: Judge, I unless some Ms. Malizia
10:26:35	15	expects to have more discovery, I believe I've received all
	16	discovery.
	17	THE COURT: You received it.
	18	MR. CHANDRA: And I will now tender it to Mr. El Bey
	19	today.
10:26:43	20	THE COURT: Okay. That's fine. I just want to make
	21	sure he gets it.
	22	MS. MALIZIA: Certainly, yes. All Rule 16 has been
	23	produced.
	24	THE COURT: I'm sorry?
10:26:50	25	MS. MALIZIA: All the Rule 16 discovery has been

	1	produced in this case to Mr. Chandra.
	2	THE COURT: Okay. So I see, so there isn't going to
	3	be any more between now and this hearing at the end of
	4	October?
10:27:02	5	MS. MALIZIA: No, your Honor.
	6	THE COURT: So just a chance for Mr. El Bey to study
	7	it.
	8	MS. MALIZIA: Certainly if the government becomes
	9	aware of additional discovery, we will produce it promptly,
10:27:12	10	but at this time, I'm not aware of any.
	11	THE DEFENDANT: And also I know we got a schedule
	12	date for September 25th. Would that day still
	13	THE COURT: No.
	14	THE DEFENDANT: Okay.
10:27:21	15	THE COURT: That's off.
	16	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, 'cause we're going to set a new
	17	date for today.
	18	THE COURT: So well, Mr. El Bey, I would suggest
	19	that you use whatever free time you have between now and the
10:27:32	20	end of October, not only in studying these discovery
	21	materials, but studying trying to familiarize yourself, to
	22	the extent you don't feel familiar, with judicial procedures.
	23	It's all online, you know. You can look up the Federal Rules
	24	of Evidence.
10:27:57	25	THE DEFENDANT: I have the book.

	1	THE COURT: Okay. All right.
	2	THE LAW CLERK: Judge?
	3	THE COURT: Yes.
	4	Question from my law clerk.
10:28:07	5	(Discussion held off the record.)
	6	THE COURT: My law clerk just suggested, Mr. El Bey,
	7	I ask you, you said you didn't want to have standby counsel.
	8	I just wanted to ask you or he suggests I ask you why?
	9	THE DEFENDANT: Why?
10:28:31	10	THE COURT: Yes.
	11	THE DEFENDANT: I have some other people in law
	12	representing me, helping me study and prepare for the case.
	13	THE COURT: I see. You have people who will help
	14	you.
10:28:41	15	THE DEFENDANT: Yes, sir. I have some other people
	16	helping me with the case, yes, sir.
	17	THE COURT: Is that it?
	18	MS. MALIZIA: Your Honor, if we could set a schedule
	19	for pretrial motions in advance of the next status hearing, I
10:28:54	20	would suggest two weeks before the next status.
	21	THE COURT: Now, wait. Next status hearing, that's
	22	different from the end of October or what?
	23	MS. MALIZIA: No. So if we are setting the next
	24	status for the end of October, I just want to be clear are we
10:29:10	25	going to be litigating pretrial motions at that time, or is

	1	that just to allow the defendant to review discovery and we'll
	2	set a motions calendar at that on that date?
	3	THE COURT: No, I would think, given we're talking
	4	about six weeks that that both you and Mr. El Bey should be
10:29:33	5	prepared at that hearing to present any motions, or before. I
	6	don't know.
	7	MS. MALIZIA: In that case, may I suggest setting a
	8	date for pretrial motions two weeks before that with responses
	9	due the week before the status hearing?
10:29:58	10	THE COURT: Well, I want to give Mr. El Bey the six
	11	weeks to prepare any motions.
	12	MS. MALIZIA: So you're anticipating him filing
	13	motions on that date.
	14	THE COURT: On that, yeah, the end of October.
10:30:10	15	MS. MALIZIA: When would the government's response be
	16	due?
	17	THE COURT: You won't be filing motions?
	18	MS. MALIZIA: Well, it's possible we would file
	19	pretrial motions. I don't anticipate at this time, but we
10:30:22	20	would like a chance to respond in writing
	21	THE COURT: No, of course.
	22	MS. MALIZIA: to Mr. El Bey's motions.
	23	THE COURT: So how much time would you like?
	24	MS. MALIZIA: I think a week should be fine.
10:30:30	25	THE COURT: A week? Okay. That's fine.

	1	And should the government file any motions, you would
	2	also have a week.
	3	THE DEFENDANT: Okay.
	4	THE COURT: So are we all set? Is that it?
10:30:47	5	MS. MALIZIA: What would that date be in October,
	6	your Honor?
	7	THE COURT: Oh, I'll have to look at my calendar, and
	8	I'll notify everybody today.
	9	THE DEFENDANT: Okay.
10:30:57	10	THE COURT: Why, do you have a particular conflict
	11	or
	12	MS. MALIZIA: Not at this time, but we can look for
	13	the minute order.
	14	THE COURT: All right. So I will set that.
10:31:04	15	THE DEFENDANT: Okay.
	16	THE COURT: Do you have a particular day in late in
	17	October that would be bad for you?
	18	THE DEFENDANT: Any time after the 25th of October
	19	would be fine.
10:31:15	20	THE COURT: 25th?
	21	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
	22	THE COURT: Do you want to say tentatively the 25th?
	23	MS. MALIZIA: The 25th is a Saturday.
	24	THE DEFENDANT: Okay.
10:31:22	25	THE COURT: Monday the it would be the 27th?

	1	THE DEFENDANT: That's fine.
	2	MS. MALIZIA: And just to be clear, the defendant's
	3	pretrial motions will be due on that date with the
	4	government's responses due or any response due from either
10:31:35	5	party a week
	6	THE COURT: A week.
	7	MS. MALIZIA: after that.
	8	THE COURT: Yeah. Okay.
	9	MS. MALIZIA: The government would also move to
10:31:41	10	exclude time between now and the next status date.
	11	THE COURT: To do what?
	12	MS. MALIZIA: In the interests of justice.
	13	THE COURT: Oh, for the Speedy Trial Act.
	14	MS. MALIZIA: Yes, the Speedy Trial Act.
10:31:50	15	THE COURT: That's fine. So I should write
	16	something, shouldn't I? I mean, shouldn't I issue an order?
	17	MS. MALIZIA: Yes. I think typically in the minute
	18	order, you include the date of the next status, the schedule
	19	for pretrial motions, and the granting the motion to exclude
10:32:04	20	time as well.
	21	MR. CHANDRA: And, Judge, just for the record, I'm
	22	assuming that the motion to withdraw has been granted?
	23	THE COURT: Yes, that's that's fine, subject to
	24	your maybe it's not a total withdrawal because you'll make
10:32:23	25	sure that Mr. El Bey gets all these materials, and if he has

```
1
             difficulty -- this is online, is that the problem?
         2
                      MR. CHANDRA:
                                    No, Judge, I have it here. They're on
         3
             two disks.
         4
                      THE COURT: Right. So if he has any trouble opening
         5
             that, you'll help him.
10:32:37
         6
                      MR. CHANDRA:
                                    I will.
         7
                      MS. MALIZIA: Your Honor, I'd ask to, in addition to
         8
             your granting Mr. Chandra's motion to withdraw, if you could
         9
             also enter a minute order finding the defendant's waiver of
        10
             counsel knowing and voluntary.
10:32:50
        11
                      THE COURT: I'm sorry, finding what?
        12
                      MS. MALIZIA: Finding the defendant's waiver of
        13
             counsel knowing and voluntary.
        14
                      THE COURT: Yes. All right. That's it. Okay.
        15
             So --
10:33:06
        16
                      MR. CHANDRA: Thank you, your Honor.
        17
                      THE DEFENDANT:
                                      So I can -- you'll e-mail it to --
        18
             the dates and everything that we need to know about? You say
        19
             you're going to put it on a -- we haven't got a date yet.
        20
             You're going to notify by e-mail --
10:33:18
        21
                      THE COURT: No. I think October 27th will be the
        22
             date --
        23
                      THE DEFENDANT:
                                      Okay. October 27th, okay.
        24
                      THE COURT: -- for filing any motions and then a week
        25
             to respond.
10:33:27
```

	1	MS. MALIZIA: I think Mr. El Bey's concern is that
	2	he's not on ECF at this time, but we can try to assist him
	3	THE COURT: You mean to get
	4	MS. MALIZIA: to receive notification.
10:33:38	5	THE COURT: online notification of everything?
	6	THE DEFENDANT: Yes.
	7	THE COURT: Okay. So that's something that you will
	8	help that they will help you get.
	9	THE DEFENDANT: Okay.
10:33:45	10	THE COURT: Okay.
	11	THE DEFENDANT: I appreciate it, Judge.
	12	THE COURT: Okay.
	13	THE DEFENDANT: Thank you very much.
	14	THE COURT: Okay. So we'll be in recess. Thank you
10:33:52	15	for your attendance.
	16	THE DEFENDANT: Thank you very much.
	17	THE COURT: And see you next month.
	18	MS. MALIZIA: Thank you, your Honor.
	19	(Which were all the proceedings heard.)
	20	CERTIFICATE
	21	I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript from
	22	the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter.
	23	/s/Kathleen M. Fennell February 11, 2016
	24	Kathleen M. Fennell Date
	25	Official Court Reporter